

SOUTH HAMS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE



Minutes of a meeting of the **South Hams Development Management Committee** held on **Wednesday, 14th August, 2019 at 10.00 am** at the **Council Chamber - Follaton House**

Present: **Councillors:**

Chairman Cllr Brazil
Vice Chairman Cllr Foss

Cllr Brown
Cllr Holway
Cllr Abbott
Cllr Long
Cllr Pringle

Cllr Hodgson
Cllr Rowe
Cllr Kemp
Cllr Pannell
Cllr Taylor

In attendance:

Councillors:

Cllr Hawkins

Cllr Pennington

Officers:

Head of Development Management Practice
Senior Specialist – Planning
Planning Specialists
Deputy Monitoring Officer
Devon County Council (DCC) Highways Officer
Specialist - Strategic Planning
Specialist – Democratic Services

17. **Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 17 July 2019 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

18. **Declarations of Interest**

Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered and the following were made:

Cllr R Foss declared a personal interest in application **0620/18/FUL**: Provision of an agricultural workers dwelling – Borough Farm, East Allington, by virtue of being involved with Kingsbridge Show which took place on this site and he remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon;

Cllr V Abbott declared a personal interest in application **1386/19/OPA**: construction of 2no. residential dwellings on an infill site, formerly Whiteoaks camp site – ‘Whiteoaks’, Davids Lane, Filham by virtue of knowing the applicant and he remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon;

Cllrs R Rowe and B Taylor declared a personal interest in the following planning applications that were sited within the South Devon AONB by virtue of being Members of the South Devon AONB Partnership Committee and they remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon:

1430/19/FUL: Erection of 16 metal self-storage units as part of farm diversification scheme – Barn, Higher Easton Farm, St Anns Chapel;

1291/19/HHO: Householder application for rear extension and modifications (retrospective) – 36 Above Town, Dartmouth;

2134/19/FUL: Erection of a monument to commemorate the 150th Anniversary of lifeboat based at Salcombe – Cross Gardens, Onslow Road, Salcombe; and

2132/19/FUL: Proposed erection of monument – The Quay, Car Park, Kingsbridge.

19. **Public Participation**

The Chairman announced that a list of members of the public and town and parish council representatives, who had registered their wish to speak at the meeting, had been circulated.

20. **Planning Applications**

The Committee considered the details of the planning applications prepared by the Planning Case Officers as presented in the agenda papers, and considered also the comments of Town and Parish Councils together with other representations received, which were listed within the presented agenda reports, and **RESOLVED** that:

a) **1430/19/FUL Barn, Higher Easton Farm, St Anns Chapel
Parish: Bigbury**

Erection of 16 metal self-storage units as part of farm diversification scheme

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter – Mrs Hazel Marshall: Ward Member – Cllr Taylor

Recommendation: Refusal

During discussion, a number of Members stated that this proposal satisfied a need, and the support of the Parish Council was also noted.

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval, with the Head of DM Practice being given delegated authority, in consultation with the Chairman of the Committee and the local Ward Member, to approve the final wording of the conditions.

Reasons:

The public benefit of the proposal outweighed the harm and the landscaping scheme would conserve and enhance the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty in accordance with Policy DEV 25.

**b) 1291/19/HHO 36 Above Town, Dartmouth
Parish: Dartmouth**

Householder application for rear extension and modifications (retrospective)

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Objector – Mr Gareth Roberts: Supporter – Mr Ciaran McClennon: Town Council – Cllr Graham Evans: Ward Members Cllrs Hawkins and Rowe

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval

Conditions:

Standard Time Limit

Accord with plans

Material samples to be submitted

No use of flat roof areas for amenity purposes

Non-opening windows/doors to west elevation

No insertion of new windows, doors or openings restriction

Use of obscure glass to window facing no. 34

c) 1548/19/OPA Land adjoining Westerland Dale, Westerland, Marlton Parish: Marlton

Outline application (all matters reserved) for construction of a single storey dwelling with garage, and alterations to existing vehicular access

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter – Mr Derek Webber: Parish Council – Cllr Gordon Page: Ward Member – Cllr Pennington

Recommendation: Refusal

Committee Decision: Refusal

d) 1386/19/OPA Whiteoaks, Davids Lane, Filham Parish: Ugborough

Construction of 2no. residential dwellings on an infill site, formerly Whiteoaks camp site

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter – Mrs Rachel French: Ward Member – Cllr Holway

Recommendation: Refusal

Members had a difficult debate on this application. The case officer outlined the Policy reasons for Refusal of the proposal. Some Members argued the sustainability of the site, and that the site bordered an allocated site where permission for 200 houses had already been given. However, the infrastructure to support the allocated site was not in place until that site was constructed, and therefore the proposal was contrary to policies within the JLP and the Ugborough Neighbourhood Plan.

Committee Decision: Refusal

e) 0620/18/FUL Borough Farm, East Allington Parish: East Allington

Provision of an agricultural workers dwelling

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter – Mrs Amanda Burden: Ward Member – Cllr Foss

Recommendation: Refusal

During discussion, a number of Members disagreed with the view of the agricultural consultant and felt that the applicant had demonstrated an agricultural need for an additional dwelling based on the stock levels at the farm. Members also felt it was important to support rural businesses where possible. The Head of DM Practice asked that approval be conditional and that conditions be agreed in consultation with the Committee Chairman and local Ward Member.

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval, with the Head of DM Practice being given delegated authority, in consultation with the Chairman of the Committee and the local Ward Member, to approve the final wording of the conditions.

Reasons:

Members had considered the evidence provided to them including stock levels and had considered the agricultural consultant's report but had come to a different conclusion.

f) 2134/19/FUL Cross Gardens, Onslow Road, Salcombe Parish: Salcombe

Erection of a monument to commemorate the 150th Anniversary of lifeboat based at Salcombe

Case Officer Update: As the consultation period had not ended, the recommendation should be amended to take account of any further letters of representation received

Speakers included: Ward Member – Cllrs Long and Pearce (statement supplied)

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval delegated to Head of Development Management Practice, subject to no additional material comments being made

Conditions:

1. Time limit
2. Accord with plans

**g) 2132/19/FUL The Quay, Car Park, Kingsbridge
Parish: Kingsbridge**

Proposed erection of monument

Case Officer Update: As the consultation period had not ended, the recommendation should be amended to take account of any further letters of representation received; no objection from Kingsbridge Town Council

Speakers included: None

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Committee Decision: Conditional Approval delegated to Head of Development Management Practice, subject to no additional material comments being made

Conditions:

1. Time limit
2. Approved plans

21. Planning Appeals Update

Members noted the list of appeals as outlined in the presented agenda report. The Head of Development Management Practice provided further detail on specific decisions.

22. Planning Performance Indicators

Members noted the Planning Performance Indicators as set out in the presented report.

The Meeting concluded at 1.05 pm

Signed by:

Chairman

Voting Analysis for Planning Applications – DM Committee 14 August 2019

Application No:	Site Address	Vote	Councillors who Voted Yes	Councillors who Voted No	Councillors who Voted Abstain	Absent
1430/19/ARM	Higher Easton Farm, St Anns Chapel	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Abbott, Brazil, Brown, Foss, Holway, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe, Pringle, Hodgson (12)	(0)	(0)	(0)
1291/19/HHO	36 Above Town, Dartmouth	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Abbott, Brazil, Foss, Holway, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe, Pringle (10)	Cllrs Brown, Hodgson (2)	(0)	(0)
1548/19/OPA	Land adjoining Westerland Dale, Westerland, Marldon	Refusal	Cllrs Brazil, Brown, Foss, Holway, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Pringle, Hodgson (10)	Cllrs Abbott, Rowe (2)	(0)	(0)
1386/19/OPA	Whiteoaks, Davids Lane, Filham	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Brown, Pringle, Holway, Hodgson, Abbott (5)	Cllrs Brazil, Foss, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe (7)	(0)	(0)
1386/19/OPA	Whiteoaks, Davids Lane, Filham	Refusal	Cllrs Brazil, Foss, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe (7)	Cllrs Brown, Pringle, Holway, Hodgson, Abbott (5)	(0)	(0)
0620/18/FUL	Borough Farm, East Allington	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Abbott, Foss, Holway, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe, Hodgson (9)	Cllrs Brown, Pringle (2)	Cllr Brazil (1)	(0)
2134/19/FUL	Cross Gardens, Onslow Road, Salcombe	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Abbott, Brazil, Brown, Foss, Holway, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe, Pringle, Hodgson (12)	(0)	(0)	(0)
2132/19/FUL	The Quay, Car Park, Kingsbridge	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Abbott, Brazil, Brown, Foss, Holway, Kemp, Long, Pannell, Taylor, Rowe, Pringle, Hodgson (12)	(0)	(0)	(0)

This page is intentionally left blank